THE MESSAGE OF THE FOUR SPECIES

GEULA TWERSKY

The obligation to take the four species, the *lulav*, *etrog*, *hadas* and *arava*, is an integral part of the Sukkot holiday. The Torah, however, does not offer any explanation for this mysterious commandment. The transcendent quality of the four species is palpably intensified by its cornucopia of vivid colors and intoxicating aromas. The juxtaposition of the mandate to take the four species, immediately following the agricultural aspect of the Succot holiday, frames the practice as fundamentally harvest related:

> *Mark, on the fifteenth day of the seventh month, when you have gathered in the yield of your land, you shall observe the festival of the LORD [to last] seven days: a complete rest on the first day, and a complete rest on the eighth day. On the first day you shall take the product of hadar trees, branches of palm trees, boughs of leafy trees, and willows of the brook, and you shall rejoice before your God the LORD seven days. You shall observe it as a festival of the LORD for seven days in the year; you shall observe it in the seventh month as a law for all time, throughout the ages. You shall live in booths seven days; all citizens in Israel shall live in booths, in order that future generations may know that I made the Israelite people live in booths when I brought them out of the land of Egypt – I, your God the LORD* (Lev. 23: 39-43).

A variety of allegorical approaches for unpacking the esoteric meaning of the four species are offered by the Midrash.[1] Some of these include the four species relating to different aspects of God, parts of the human body, agricultural areas in the Land of Israel, and types of Jewish people. The Talmud focuses on the dependence of the four species upon water.[2] Maimonides understood the four species to relate to Israel's entry into the Land of Israel in the days of Joshua, and to the outstanding flora native to the land.[3] Arthur Schaffer analyzes the unique water needs of the four species within their ecological framework, explaining them to "symbolize water in the diverse ecological habitats of Israel: the desert wilderness, the mountains and hills, the cultivated plains, and the river valleys."[4] Each one of these explanations adds valuable insight into our understanding of the rich symbolism of the four species. Nonetheless, several questions remain unanswered.

The assumed correlation between the four species and the harvest festival aspect of the Succot holiday is highly counterintuitive, as none of the four species feature any edible fruit. This incongruence is accentuated by the citron, an ornamental fruit that is for all intents and purposes non-edible.[5] In addition to the perplexing relationship between the four species and the harvest, we may add that the practice of taking the four species on the holiday of Succot has a qualitatively different texture than other holiday command-

Geula Twersky has MA's in Bible from Yeshiva University and from Bar Ilan University. She is the author of Song of Riddles: Deciphering the Song of Songs *(Gefen, 2018), and the newly released volume* Torah Song: The Theological Role of Torah Poetry *(Kodesh Press, 2022). She is also a professional artist* www.geulaart.com

ments. Whereas other commandments involving ritual objects require that they be used to perform a particular action, such as blowing the shofar, eating matzah, or dwelling in a succah, the commandment to take the four species does not per se require any further action.[6] In this essay I will continue to search for clues that will lead towards a better understanding of this mysterious commandment. I will begin with an examination of the citron, the *pri etz hadar*, 'product of hadar trees,' arguably the most enigmatic of the four. Unlocking the mystery of the citron will provide us with the keys for accessing the hidden meaning of the entire set.

PRI ETZ HADAR (ETROG)

The citron's presence among the four species intensifies the question of the four species' relationship to the harvest festival, not only insofar as it is an ornamental, and essentially non-edible fruit, but also on account of the fact that the citron may be harvested year round, and not exclusively at the end of Summer.[7] Furthermore, the citron is not native to the Land of Israel.[8] Those who suggest that the citron was only inducted into the four species following the biblical period,[9] cannot account for the fact that the citron's place together with the four species is uncharacteristically uncontested in all of the Rabbinic literature.[10] The antiquity of the citron tradition is further corroborated by the incident in which the incensed masses used citrons to pelt Alexander Yanai, in his role as high priest, causing significant damage to the temple altar.[11] It stands to reason that the citron, a rare luxury fruit, would have had to have been widely available for those events to have occurred,[12] implying a long-standing horticultural tradition.[13]

HADAR AND MILITARY PAGEANTRY

Getting at the role of the citron within the four species necessitates reflection on the etymology of the word *hadar*. Whereas the word is certainly used to connote honor, glory, and royalty, one of its primary meanings is battle pageantry.[14] A brief survey of the word's appearance in the Bible within a military context will have significant implications for its relevance to the citron, and to the four species set.[15]

The military aspect of *hadar* may be observed in Moshe's blessing to Yosef, which likens the tribe to a battle-ready ox replete with majestic/militaristic horns.

> *Like a firstling bull in his majesty, (hadar lo) He has horns like the horns of the wild ox; With them he gores the peoples, The ends of the earth one and all. These are the myriads of Ephraim. Those are the thousands of Manasseh* (Deut. 33:17).

The psalmist calls upon the anointed king to gird himself in splendid war accoutrements, which are described as *hadar*:[16] *Gird your sword upon your thigh, O hero, in your splendor and glory (hodkha vehadarekha)* (Ps. 45:4).

Hadar is etymologically related to the Arabic *hadara,* blood. This offers insight into the word's dual connotation of splendor and military grandeur.[17] Isaiah uses the word in precisely this fashion, mixing the blood/battle meaning with God's majesty:[18]

> *Who is this coming from Edom, In crimsoned garments from Bozrah – Who is this, majestic (hadur) in attire, Pressing forward in His great might? "It is I, who contend victoriously, Powerful to give triumph." Why is your clothing so red, Your garments like his who treads grapes? "I trod out a vintage alone; Of the peoples no man was with Me. I trod them down in My anger, trampled them in My rage; Their life-blood bespattered My garments, And all My clothing was stained. For I had planned a day of vengeance, And My year of redemption arrived*. (Isa. 63: 1-4).

The term *Hadar* also appears in Isaiah's depiction of the magnificence of God's salvation. This text likens God's revelation to the effects of lifegiving water in an arid desert:

> *The arid desert shall be glad. The wilderness shall rejoice and shall blossom like a rose. It shall blossom abundantly. It shall also exult and shout. It shall receive the glory of Lebanon, The splendor of Carmel and Sharon. They shall behold the glory of the LORD, The splendor (hadar) of our God. Strengthen the hands that are slack; Make firm the tottering knees! Say to the anxious of heart, "Be strong, fear not; Behold your God! Requital is coming. The recompense of God – He Himself is coming to give you triumph."* (Isa. 35: 1-4).

The military and majestic connotations of the word *hadar*, together with its relationship to the restorative water-like qualities of God's revelation in an arid desert, will serve as a template for our examination of the entire four species ensemble. We will be in a better position to evaluate the significance of the model being presented here after observing its recurrence by each of the plants featured in the four species set.

BRANCHES OF PALM TREES (LULAV)

There is a rich tradition of the palm branch as a symbol of military victory in the ancient world.[19] The Maccabees used the palm branch as an emblem of their victory over the Greeks,[20] and minted palm branches onto their coins.[21] The stately palm tree represents victory in Psalm 92, where it is cast as the foil for evildoers and their ephemeral success which is likened to grass:

> *But You are exalted, O LORD, for all time. Surely, your enemies, O LORD, surely, Your enemies perish; all evildoers are scattered. You raise my horn high like that of a wild ox; I am soaked in freshening oil. I shall see the defeat of my watchful foes, hear of the downfall of the wicked who beset me. The righteous bloom like a date-palm; they thrive like a cedar in Lebanon; planted in the house of the LORD, they flourish in the courts of our God*. (Ps. 92: 9-14)

The Sages, in line with the victory symbolism of the palm branch, assert that the four species proclaim victory:

R. Avin said, "[There is a relevant] parable about two that went into a judge, and we do not know who was victorious. Rather we know that the one that [comes out] carrying a palm branch is the winner. So [too] Israel and the nations of the world come and prosecute [each other] before the Holy One, blessed be He, on Rosh Hashanah and we do not know who won. Rather when we see that Israel is coming out from in front of the Holy One, blessed be He, with their lulavs and citrons in their hands, we know that Israel are the winners (and that creates a need to offer an offering of joy, as well as the holiday offering). Hence, Moshe warns Israel and says to them (Leviticus 23:40), *And you shall take for yourselves*." (Vayikra Rabbah, *Emor*, 30: 2)

Date palms were also fundamental to the décor of Solomon's Temple. Reliefs of date palms adorned the Temple's interior walls,[22] doors,[23] and its ten portable lavers.[24] Furthermore, Psalm 92, noted above, squarely places the date palm image within the Temple confines. The Temple's richly saturated date palm ornamentation suggests a symbolic relationship to the imminent presence of God. The date palm as a symbol of God's manifestation is further articulated in Joel, where palm shaped smoke pillars portend the pouring out of God's spirit upon mankind:

After that, I will pour out My spirit on all flesh; Your sons and daughters shall prophesy; Your old men shall dream dreams. And your young men shall see visions. I will even pour out My spirit Upon male and female slaves in those days. Before the great and terrible day of the LORD comes, I will set portents in the sky and on earth: Blood and fire and pillars (timrot) of smoke. (Joel 3: 1-3)

The date palm in Joel, which appears in the vision of "pillars (*timrot*) of smoke," has a theophanic quality.[25] This connotation is confirmed by the phrase's verbatim appearance in the Song of Songs, in a text replete with Temple metaphors.[26]

In addition to its rich theological symbolism, the oasis thriving date palm is also a palpable symbol of the life-giving qualities of water in an arid desert. This is clearly represented in Israel's brief stopover at Elim along their desert journey, where they serendipitously came upon twelve springs of water and seventy date palms.[27]

The notions conjured by desert date palm imagery in the Bible range from the heroic to the theophanic and ultimately to its thirst quenching, life affirming qualities. These associations confirm the ideological relevance of the date palm to the citron, the *pri etz hadar*. Our discussion will now shift to the *hadas* and the *arava,* which will be shown to agree with the symbolic pattern being developed here.

BOUGHS OF LEAFY TREES (HADAS)

The Torah specifies that the branch of an *avot* tree be taken. The word *avot* can be used to mean a thick leafy bough,[28] however it also refers to braided cordwork.[29] This underlies the plant's identification with myrtle (*Hadas*), whose foliage has a plaited appearance.[30] The overwhelmingly predominant use of the word *avot*/cord in the Bible is as a

tool for restraining captives, affording a military texture to the word.[31] The secondary context in which the word *avot*/cord appears in the Bible, is in the context of the vestments of the high priest, which the Torah refers to as majestic (*tifferet*).[32] The *Urim ve-Thummim*, which functioned as a conduit for communication with God,[33] was kept inside the folds of the golden breastplate, and attached to the *ephod* by two golden *avot*/cords.[34] These two contexts of the word *avot*/cord in the Bible, the military and the majestic/prophetic, are complemented by a third in Hosea. This last case features *avot*/cord, within the context of God's loving and life affirming care for Israel during the period of their desert sojourn:

> *I fell in love with Israel when he was still a child; and I have called [him] My son ever since Egypt. Thus, were they called, but they went their own way; they sacrifice to Baalim and offer to carved images. I have pampered Ephraim, taking them in My arms; But they have ignored My healing care. I drew them with human ties, with cords (avot) of love; But I seemed to them as one who imposed a yoke on their jaws, though I was offering them food.* (Hos. 11:1-5)

God's loving care for Israel in the desert was most essentially manifested by the provisioning of a constant fresh water supply. Interestingly, the word *avot* can also refer to dense rainclouds.[35] To summarize, the different contexts featuring the word *avot* in the Bible show the word to reference; a military tool, the majestic priestly vestments, God's life affirming care in an arid desert, and dense water laden rainclouds.

WILLOWS OF THE BROOK (ARAVA)

The willow of the brook, as its very name indicates, is integrally connected to fresh water. The word *arava* can also be used to mean a raincloud.[36] Isaiah uses the *arava* as a metaphor for the messianic future when prophecy will be as prevalent as water: *Fear not, My servant Jacob, Jeshurun whom I have chosen, even as I pour water on thirsty soil, and rain upon dry ground, so will I pour My spirit on your offspring, My blessing upon your posterity. And they shall sprout like grass, like willows (k'aravim) by watercourses.* (Isa. 44:2-4)

Counterintuitively, the same word which suggests a copious water supply, *arava*, can also mean a desert or a barren wilderness.[37] Isaiah describes a time in the future when God will inflict his vengeance upon evildoers, causing the blind to see and the desert/wilderness, *arava*, to flow with copious water:

> *Say to the anxious of heart, "Be strong, fear not; Behold your God! Requital (nakam) is coming, the recompense of God – He Himself is coming to give you triumph." Then the eyes of the blind shall be opened, and the ears of the deaf shall be unstopped. Then the lame shall leap like a deer, and the tongue of the dumb shall shout aloud; for waters shall burst forth in the desert, streams in the wilderness* (*ba-arava*) (Isa. 35:4-6).

This text from Isaiah casts the *arava* together with all the essential elements that we have been charting; military might, majesty, God's blessings, and the flowing of copious life-giving water in an arid desert.

THE FOUR SPECIES: A POWERFUL MILITARY SYMBOL

Our review of the four species was prompted by a series of questions:

Why do the four species, which ostensibly represent the harvest festival, not feature any edible fruit?

Considering the many different possible candidates to choose from, why did the Torah mandate that an ornamental non-edible fruit be taken to represent the harvest?

In what way might a non-indigenous fruit, whose harvest is not unique to the end of summer, aptly represent the Israelite end of summer harvest?

Why does the commandment to take the four species not fundamentally require the performance of an accompanying ritual?

The pattern that emerges from this survey suggests an approach to these questions. As a group of non-edible agricultural products, the four species are meant to operate on a symbolic plane as opposed to a functional one. The conspicuous absence of any mandated ritual to accompany the taking of the four species reinforces the practice's fundamentally non-utilitarian, representational function.[38] That is not to say that the four species do not represent the harvest. They certainly do. Rather, the unique anomalies associated with the four species beckon us to dig deeper, and to uncover its broader ramifications. Torah commandments are heavily nuanced. Meditation on the subtler message of the four species reveals the broader implications of this otherwise impenetrably enigmatic tradition. Whereas the four species are inescapably agricultural, as a group they share militaristic, majestic, and spiritual qualities. An appreciation for the full range of subtleties hinted at by the four species opens our eyes to the rich, multivalent meaning that underlies this otherwise opaque practice.

In contemplating the militaristic and spiritual implications of the four species, it is fascinating to consider R. Yochanan ben Berokha's suggestion in the Mishna that palm branches be beaten on the ground of the Temple next to the altar during the Succot holiday.[39] This practice was redirected by the Sages to feature the willow branch.[40] This highly enigmatic custom,[41] referred to as *hibut aravot,*[42] which as its name implies, involves beating,[43] is traditionally understood as having been instituted by the prophets.[44]

Let us consider the uncanny resemblance between the ancient practice of *hibut aravot*, and the text in Kings featuring the prophet Elisha and King Joash. That narrative recounts how Elisha instructed King Joash to strike arrows on the ground, in an act meant to presage Israel's military victory over Aram:

> *Elisha had been stricken with the illness of which he was to die, and King Joash of Israel went down to see him. He wept over him and cried, "Father, father! Israel's*

chariots and horsemen!" Elisha said to him, "Get a bow and arrows"; and he brought him a bow and arrows. Then he said to the king of Israel, "Grasp the bow!" And when he had grasped it, Elisha put his hands over the king's hands. "Open the window toward the east," he said; and he opened it. Elisha said, "Shoot!" and he shot. Then he said, "An arrow of victory for the LORD! An arrow of victory over Aram! You shall rout Aram completely at Aphek." He said, "Now pick up the arrows." And he picked them up. "Strike the ground!" he said to the king of Israel; and he struck three times and stopped. The man of God was angry with him and said to him, "If only you had struck five or six times! Then you would have annihilated Aram; as it is, you shall defeat Aram only three times."(II Kgs. 13: 14-19).

Elisha's instruction to King Joash to strike arrows on the ground, may be viewed against the background of the Ancient Near Eastern tradition of belomancy,[45] the ancient art of divination by use of arrows.[46] It is critical to note that Elisha emphatically declares that it is God alone who is behind Israel's military victory; "An arrow of victory for the LORD!"

Ezekiel contains a vivid dramatization of the belomancy ritual in which Nebuchadnezzar is seen practicing a variety of occult procedures on his military campaign to destroy Jerusalem.[47] Belomancy is also likely to be relevant to the account of Jonathan shooting arrows as a signal that David should flee from the wrath of Saul, in I Samuel 20.[48] The prevalence of belomancy in the ancient world underlies one of the renderings of the word arrow, *hetz*, as fate or luck.[49]

The military connotation of the four species ensemble correlates well with the commemoration of the Exodus that is integral to the Succot holiday. The Torah depicts the Nation of Israel at the time of the Exodus as proudly marching fully armed in broad daylight.[50] This description brings to mind the pageantry of a military procession. Whereas Israel was equipped with military equipment, it was ultimately the hand of God that ensured their success. This sentiment was clearly articulated by Moshe at the very moment of Israel's final departure from Egypt at Yam Suf: *The Lord will battle for you; you hold your peace!* (Ex. 14:14).

The practice of parading around on the Succot holiday with a cornucopia of agricultural products as stand-ins for implements of war calls attention to the irony of Israel's military display at the time of the Exodus. Whereas Israel might be enticed to boast that "my own power and the might of my own hand have won this wealth for me,"[51] the four species serve as a reminder that it is God alone who secures military victory.

BAR KOKHBA AND THE FOUR SPECIES

During his brief two-and-a-half-year rule in Jerusalem, Bar Kokhba minted a *selah* coin depicting the Temple on one side, and the four species on the other.[52] This ancient relic reflects a deep understanding of the underlying military and theological connotation of the four species. In an Aramaic letter written by Bar Kokhba, discovered in the archive of

letters in Nahal Hever, or the Cave of Letters, we learn about the incredible pains that Bar Kokhba took in order to provide his fighters with the Four Species:[53]

> "Shimon to Yehudah, son of Menasheh, at Qiryat Arabayyah- I have delivered to you two donkeys (in order) that you dispatch along with them two men to Yehonathan, son of Ba'yan, and to Mesabalah (in order) that they pack up and deliver to the camp, to you, palm branches and citrons. And you are to send additional persons from your place and let them bring you myrtle branches and willows. And prepare them, and deliver them to the camp, because the population is large. Fare well!"

Another letter composed in Greek features a similar request. Yigal Yadin comments on these letters as follows:[54]

> "The pathetic nature of the request lies in the fact that it is made in the midst of the war (or more probably towards its end) and Bar-Kokhba goes into great trouble to get them." Perhaps we may replace Yadin's 'pathetic' with 'heroic'. Bar Kokhba's *heroic* efforts to procure four species sets for each of his fighters in the midst of the revolt demonstrates his conviction that his fighters needed to be armed both physically and spiritually.

THE ONGOING RELEVANCE OF THE FOUR SPECIES

The plants that comprise the four species are saturated with both military and theological significance. The ironic confluence of these ideas in a set of benign agricultural products recalls the famous prophecy uttered by Isaiah and Micah: *And they shall beat their swords into plowshares and their spears into pruning hooks: Nation shall not take up sword against nation; They shall never again know war*. (Isa. 2:4, Micah 4:3)

The prophecy of Isaiah and Micah, envisioning swords and spears turning into plowshares and pruning hooks, would seem to be a deliberate reframing of the message of the four species. Furthermore, the act of beating that Isaiah and Micah reference with the term *vechitetu* resonates with the tradition of beating *aravot* upon the ground on Succot. Isaiah and Micah extended their reformulated message of the four species to include all the nations of the world. This revolutionary understanding of the implications of the four species adds context to its relationship to the Succah itself. The commandment to dwell in a Succah, like the four species, harkens back to Israel's desert sojourn and settlement in the Land of Israel, while heralding a time in the future when all nations will come together to celebrate the holiday of Succot: *All who survive of all those nations that came up against Jerusalem shall make a pilgrimage year by year to bow low to the King LORD of Hosts and to observe the Feast of Booths* (Zech. 14:16).

The act of taking the four species on the holiday of Succoth, on its most basic level, is an expression of gratitude for an abundant harvest. Yet, perhaps more fundamentally, it conveys a message that transcends time. In a deeper and more profound sense, when we take the four species on the holiday of Succot, we reaffirm our faith in divine providence,

and in the words of the prophets, that a day will come when nation will not take up sword against nation, and the world shall never again know war.

NOTES

1. Vayikra Rabbah, *Emor*, 30.
2. TB *Taanit* 2b; TJ *Taanit* 2a. The citron's unique thirst for water is discussed in TB *Kiddushin* 3a and TB *Sukkah* 35a.
3. Maimonides, *Guide for the Perplexed*, III: 43.
4. Arthur Schaffer, "The Agricultural and Ecological Symbolism of the Four Species of Sukkot," *Tradition* 20.2 (1982), 128-140, 139.
5. Dafna Langgut, "The history of Citrus medica (citron) in the Near East: Botanical remains and ancient art and texts" in *Agrumed: Archaeology and History of Citrus Fruit in the Mediterranean: Acclimatization, diversifications, uses* [online]. (Naples: Publications du Centre Jean Berars, 2017). https://books.openedition.org/pcjb/2184?lang=en
6. The practice of waving the four species is considered to be a non-essential part of the commandment, TB *Succah*, 38a; Maimonides, *hilchot shofar vesuccah velulav* 7:9.
7. The year-round availability of the fruit is commented upon by the Sages who offer a play on words relating *hadar* (goodly) to *ha-dar* (the one that is corralled together with others larger and smaller) TB *Succah* 35a.
8. The citron is believed to have made its way to the Near East from western Asia. Ramat Rachel, near Jerusalem, has yielded the earliest evidence of large-scale citron cultivation ca. 5th-4th cent. BCE.
9. Cf. Babriel Moskovitz, "The Genesis of the *Etrog* [Citron] as Part of the Four Species," *Jewish Bible Quarterly* 43.2 (2015), 109-115; Samuel Tolkowsky, "The Meaning of Pri Ets Hadar," *Journal of the Palestine Oriental Society* 8 (1928), 17-23.
10. Ibn Ezra, Leviticus 23:40, confirms that the practice of taking a citron is rooted in tradition as opposed to the fruit being the literal interpretation of the verse.
11. TB Succah, 4:9; Josephus, *Antiquities*, XIII, xiii, 5.
12. Isaac Erich adduces the biblical antiquity of the citron tradition from a second millennium Assyrian medical text that refers to the fruit as "iltakku," which corresponds to the Hebrew "etrog." He also points to archaeological evidence of the fruit in 12th cent. BCE Egypt. Isaac Erich, "Influence of Religion on the Spread of Citrus," *American Association for the Advancement of Science* 129 (1959), 179-186, 181.
13. Whereas the citron (and the willow branches) does not appear in the description of the Succot celebration in Neh. ch.8, the text there does not specifically discuss the taking of the four species. The understood antiquity of the four species during that era may be inferred from the book of Jubilees, ca. 200 years after Ezra, which attributes the practice to Abraham, Jub. 16: 29-31.
14. Ludwig Koehler, et al., *The Hebrew and Aramaic Lexicon of the Old Testament* (*HALOT*), electronic ed. (Leiden, PA: Brill, 1994–2000), s.v. "הדר, " 239.
15. In considering the militaristic nuance of the word *hadar*, it is interesting to consider the word's appearance in the Woman of Valor hymn of Prov. 31: 10-31, a poem that has been suggested by some to be a heroic hymn. Cf. Al Wolters, "Proverbs XXXI 10-13 as Heroic Hymn," *Vêtus Testamentum* 38. 4 (1988), 446-457.
16. *Hadar* is used to express the duality of God's terrifying military might and the call to glorify Him at the advent of his revelation, in Psalm 96: 1-6.
17. Ibid.
18. Elsewhere, Isaiah uses the word *hadar* to connote military fortifications. Cf. Isa. 45:2 and Targum Jonathan and Ibn Ezra ad loc.
19. Victorious athletes were awarded palm branches in ancient Greece. This is illustrated in a Panathenaic amphora from Athens depicting Nike holding a palm branch for the winner of the pankration match. See Stephen Gaylord Miller, *Ancient Greek Athletics* (New Haven: Yale Univ. Press, 2004), 122.
20. I Mac. 13:50-52, 2 Mac. 10: 1-8.
21. David Hendin, *Guide to Biblical Coins* (New York: Amphora, 1996), 82.

22. I Kings 6:29; II Chronicles 3:5.
23. I Kings 6:32.
24. I Kings 7:36.
25. *HALOT* s.v. "תמרה, " 1745.
26. Cf. Song 3: 6-11; Midrash Rabbah, *Shir Hashirim*, 3.
27. Exodus 15:27
28. *HALOT* s.v. "עבות, " 778.
29. *HALOT* s.v. "עבת, " 783.
30. TB *Succah* 32b.
31. Cf. Psalm 2:3, 118:27, 129: 4, Job 39:10, Judges 15:13-14, 16:11-12, Ezekiel 3:25, 4:8.
32. Exodus 28:2, 40. *HALOT* s.v. "תפארת, " 1772.
33. Numbers 21:21; I Samuel 28:6.
34. Exodus 28: 14, 22; 39: 15.
35. *HALOT* s.v. "עב, " 773.
36. Psalm 68:5. *HALOT* s.v. "ערבה, " 879.
37. Ibid.
38. The practice of reciting the *Hallel* and *Hoshana* prayers while holding the four species reinforces its theological role.
39. Mishna *Succah* 4:6.
40. TB Succah 45a.
41. The *Sefer ha-Toda'ah* maintains that the reason for *hibut aravot* is shrouded in mystery. Eliyahu Kitov, *Sefer ha-Toda'ah* (Jerusalem: Beit Hotzaat Sefarim, 2007), 147.
42. TB *Succah* 43b.
43. Maimonides, *Hilchot Shofar veSuccah veLulav* 7: 22. Rashi on T. B. *Succah* 44b understands the practice to involve shaking and not banging.
44. TB *Succah* 44a.
45. *Encyclopaedia Britannica: Or, A Dictionary of Arts, Sciences, and Miscellaneous Literature* Vol. 3 (Archibald Constable & Company, 1817), 549.
46. Cf. Samuel Iwry, "New Evidence for Belomancy in Ancient Palestine and Phoenicia," *Journal of the American Oriental Society* 81.1 (1961), 27-34.
47. Ezekiel 21:21.
48. TB Chulin 95b suggests that Jonathan performed an act of divination, *nichush*. Maimonides concurs with this evaluation in *Hilchot Avodah Zarah* 11:14.
49. *HALOT* s.v. "חץ, " 342. The understanding of *hetz* as implying fate or divination may have further implication for the rendering of several biblical verses, such as Job 21:21; 34:6; Gen 49: 23:23.
50. Exodus 12: 41;
51. 13:18.Deuteronomy 8:17.
52. https://www.judaism-and-rome.org/tetradrachm-selah-bar-kokhba-depicting-fa%C3%A7ade-temple-and-four-species-134-135-ce
53. http://cojs.org/bar_kokhba_letter-_132-135
54. Ibid.